

Short Communication

On a Problem of H. Freudenthal

Tongsong Jiang¹ and Xuehan Cheng²

¹Department of Mathematics, Linyi Teachers College, Linyi, Shandong, 276005 China

²Department of Mathematics, Yinan High School, Yinan, Shandong, China

Received May 14, 1996

In 1963, Freudenthal [1] posed the following interesting:

Problem. *When is the inequality*

$$\sum_{i=1}^n |a_i| - \sum_{1 \leq i < j \leq n} |a_i + a_j| + \sum_{1 \leq i < j < k \leq n} |a_i + a_j + a_k| - \dots + (-1)^{n-1} |a_1 + a_2 + \dots + a_n| \geq 0 \tag{1}$$

always true for all $a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n \in \mathbf{R}^m$?

Obviously, if $n = 1$, (1) is true.

If $n = 2$, (1) is the Minkowski inequality

$$|a + b| \leq |a| + |b|.$$

If $n = 3$, (1) is the Hlawka inequality

$$|a| + |b| + |c| - |a + b| - |a + c| - |b + c| + |a + b + c| \geq 0.$$

But if $n = 4$, Luxemburg [2] gave a counter-example showing that (1) is not true, with $a_i = c$ ($i = 1, 2, 3$), $a_4 = -2c$ ($c \neq 0$).

When $n \geq 5$, the problem has not been settled. In this paper, by means of the elementary method, the problem is solved completely.

Let $A_n = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$, $a_i = (x_{i1}, x_{i2}, \dots, x_{im}) \in \mathbf{R}^m$, $|a_i| = \left(\sum_{j=1}^m x_{ij}^2 \right)^{1/2}$, and

$$f_n(A_n) = \sum_{k=1}^n (-1)^{k-1} \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq n} \left| \sum_{j=1}^k a_{i_j} \right|.$$

Then the problem becomes: When is $f_n(A_n) \geq 0$ always true? If $n = 4, m = 1$, letting $A_4 = (c, c, c, -2c) (c \neq 0)$, we have $f_4(A_4) = -2|c| < 0$, so (1) is false, as mentioned above.

Now let

$$\begin{aligned} g_n(A_n) &= |a_n| - \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} |a_i + a_n| + \sum_{1 \leq i < j \leq n-1} |a_i + a_j + a_n| - \dots \\ &\quad + (-1)^{n-1} |a_1 + a_2 + \dots + a_n| \\ &= |a_n| + \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} (-1)^k \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq n-1} \left| \sum_{j=1}^k a_{i_j} + a_n \right|. \end{aligned}$$

Lemma 1. If $A_n = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n), a_j \in \mathbf{R}^m, j = 1, 2, \dots, n$, then $f_n(A_n) = f_{n-1}(A_{n-1}) + g_n(A_n)$.

Proof.

$$\begin{aligned} f_n(A_n) &= \sum_{k=1}^n (-1)^{k-1} \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq n} \left| \sum_{j=1}^k a_{i_j} \right| \\ &= \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} (-1)^{k-1} \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq n-1} \left| \sum_{j=1}^k a_{i_j} \right| + |a_n| - \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} |a_j + a_n| \\ &\quad + \sum_{1 \leq i < j \leq n-1} |a_i + a_j + a_n| - \dots + (-1)^{n-1} \left| \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} a_i + a_n \right| \\ &= f_{n-1}(A_{n-1}) + g_n(A_n). \end{aligned}$$

Lemma 2. If $A_n = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n) \in \mathbf{R}^n, b \in \mathbf{R}$, and $b \geq \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ a_i \leq 0}}^n |a_i|$, then $g_{n+1}(A_n, b) = 0$.

Proof. Since $b \geq \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ a_i \leq 0}}^n |a_i|$, then for $1 \leq k \leq n, \left| \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ a_i \leq 0}}^k a_i + b \right| = \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ a_i \leq 0}}^k a_i + b \geq 0$, and

$$\begin{aligned} g_{n+1}(A_n, b) &= |b| + \sum_{k=1}^n (-1)^k \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq n} \left| \sum_{j=1}^k a_{i_j} + b \right| \\ &= b + \sum_{k=1}^n (-1)^k \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq n} \left(\sum_{j=1}^k a_{i_j} + b \right) \\ &= b + \sum_{k=1}^n (-1)^k \left\{ \binom{n}{k} b + \binom{n-1}{k-1} \sum_{j=1}^n a_j \right\} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= b \sum_{k=0}^n \binom{n}{k} (-1)^k - \sum_{j=1}^n a_j \sum_{k=0}^{n-1} \binom{n-1}{k} (-1)^k \\
 &= b \cdot 0 - \left(\sum_{j=1}^n a_j \right) \cdot 0 = 0. \quad \blacksquare
 \end{aligned}$$

Lemma 3. If $C_{m+n} = (A_m, B_n) = (a_1, \dots, a_m, b_1, \dots, b_n) \in \mathbb{R}^{m+n}$ and $b_j \geq \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ a_i \leq 0}}^n |a_i|$, $j = 1, 2, \dots, n$, then $f_{m+n}(C_{m+n}) = f_m(A_m)$.

Proof. By Lemma 1,

$$\begin{aligned}
 f_{m+n}(C_{m+n}) &= f_{m+n}(A_m, B_n) \\
 &= f_{m+n-1}(A_m, B_{n-1}) + g_{m+n}(A_m, B_n) \\
 &= f_m(A_m) + \sum_{k=1}^n g_{m+k}(A_m, B_k).
 \end{aligned}$$

Since $b_j \geq \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ a_i \leq 0}}^n |a_i| \geq 0$, $j = 1, 2, \dots, n$, then for $1 \leq k \leq n$, $\sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ b_i \leq 0}}^n |b_i| = 0$, and

$$b_k \geq \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ a_i \leq 0}}^n |a_i| + \sum_{\substack{i=1 \\ b_i \leq 0}}^n |b_i|.$$

By Lemma 2, $g_{m+k}(A_m, B_k) = 0$, and $f_{m+n}(C_{m+n}) = f_m(A_m)$. The lemma is thus proved. ■

We now pass to the proof of our result.

By Lemma 3, for all $c > 0$, if $A_n = (c, c, c, -2c, 2c, \dots, 2c) \in \mathbb{R}^n$, then $f_n(A_n) = f_4(c, c, c, -2c) = -2c < 0$.

If $A_n = (a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n)$, $a_i \in \mathbb{R}^m$, $i = 1, 2, \dots, n$, let $a_1 = a_2 = a_3 = (c, 0, \dots, 0)$, $-a_4 = a_5 = \dots = a_n = (2c, 0, \dots, 0)$, then also $f_n(A_n) = f_4(c, c, c, -2c) = -2c < 0$.

From the above, we have

Theorem. For any $a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n \in \mathbb{R}^m$, the inequality (1) is always true if and only if $n = 1, 2, 3$.

References

1. H. Freudenthal, Problem 141, *Wisk Opgaven* 21 (1963) 137–139.
2. D. C. Mitrinovic, *Analytic Inequalities*, Springer-Verlag, New York, 1970.